

I. Roberto Benigni and Subaltern Voice in *Life is Beautiful*

The research work has analyzed this movie *Life is Beautiful* by Roberto Benigni and Vincenzo Cerami (1999) from the perspective of subaltern studies to show how Benigni has depicted the subaltern's resistance and voice in particular and whole marginalized people's voice in general, who have been marginalized, exploited, suppressed, oppressed, dominated, and excluded by dominant ruling groups or elite, through the use of humor, despite having painful, terrifying and horrific situation on them. Benigni, within the same Jew race, has tried to bring the issue of Jew (margin) race. He is conscious of his subalternity and attempt to speak in his movie, through the major character, Guido. He is even the prototype of Benigni, who is suffering due to being Jew, from the Nazi ruler Hitler.

On the surface the movie appears to be comic movie on holocaust leaving a little room for the critical analysis of the movie through subaltern theory as the major character are struggling for their existence all over their life and are trying to get relief through the use of comic and humorous presentation. The movie presents subaltern's issues through the relentless struggle of Guido for his dream to have a happy and bright future with resistance and self-representation changing their fate and raising their silenced, scattered, and dominated voice against the marginalization. Subaltern wants to preserve their identity and live with dignity.

The screen writer, director has his own politics behind the representation of the marginalization through the comic representation of subaltern's voice to bring the silenced and scattered voice from the inner part of the history of holocaust to redraw the history. History is always supporting to the powerful elite, because history writer, intellectual or legislators are also from the elite groups, so that to write actual history, subaltern also should be presented in the history. They contributed to the social activities even more than elite. History only covered with elite's praise, so Tara Lal

Shrestha in his book *Shakti Shrasta Subaltern* writes “Although subaltern contributes they doesn’t have history, elite doesn’t allow writing subaltern’s history because elite’s biased history is already filled up in the subaltern’s history writing. The history written from the top to support the elite will not be able to capture the subaltern” (My Trans.14). Here he refers that elites never wants to do anything for the subaltern and any fruitful for the marginal.

Here he refers history should be written from the below then only subalterns can be seen. It seems to be appropriate to discuss about marginalization, its nature, causes, effects and consequences in brief. It is an infamous event in human history where millions of Jews and other had to die for no reason at all, by Hitler’s German troop during World War II. Before they were killed the victim’s valuables were stripped from them. Their hair is used to stuff mattresses, and any gold in their teeth was melted down means their valuables are utilized by elite but subaltern people are considered as less than human. David Ludden also argues how the subalterns are used for others than their own. In particular he says, “ By such reification he or she or they serve and satisfy other underlying needs the history writing meets and again subaltern is apparently appropriate for the purpose of other than their own” (RSS-209).

Based on this historical event numerous books have been written, and movies have been released. This movie *Life is Beautiful*, which is going to be discussed here, presents the marginalization and subordination of the people. It is obvious to mislead the audiences who are ignored about the reasons happenings and the consequences of the subalternity/marginalization.

Life is Beautiful is an Italian movie based on the marginalization allocates more time to the humor and comic scenes. This movie has given more weight to the minor aspects than major ones to present the subaltern’s muted voice rather than the elites, which is written in the history, because history is always written in the favor of

powerful elite. Michael Foucault in “Power/Knowledge” writes that, “... nothing is far from the influence of power” (8). He believes that intellectual as well other all people are affected by the power politics. The audiences, who go to the cinema with the preoccupied mind of watching the colonial movie based on holocaust, get confused about whether s/he has gone to the wrong cinema hall. The audience comes to know the hidden part of the movie through the post-colonial viewpoint. Some of the incident in the movie makes the audiences laugh uncontrollably. Benigni has stated that *Life is Beautiful* is somehow inspired by the story told by his father, Luigi, which he experienced in a Nazi concentration camp in Erfurt, Germany.

The first act of the movie is set before the World War II took place. The Jewish-Italian Guido Orifice comes into Arezzo, Italy to open a book store, which he accomplishes later on. Initially, he faces some administrative problems due to being other caste to open the book store and works as a waiter in the hotel, where his uncle Eliseo is also present. Here the suffering, exploitation and domination of the elite on subaltern character Guido is taken no any consideration by other, but if we go in depth then we can get this as the major concern of the director to raise the muted and silenced voice inside the humorous activities of the characters indirectly. Gramsci claims that “The history of subaltern social group is necessarily fragmented and episodic [...] dies exit [...] but this tendency is continuously interrupted by representative of ruling group. Subaltern voice, which I am going to investigate make my research different from the others as they have ignored this aspect of the movie and have focused only on the presentation of holocaust but not the post –colonial attitude of the writer.

The issue of representation has become a much debated topic not only in post-colonial studies and academia, but in the larger cultural areas these days. Representation has been linked with democracy and politics also. For Irish Marian

Young “The Suppression of differences is a problem for all representation” (351).

Representatives of large districts or of small communities must negotiate the difficulty of one person representing many. Because such a difficulty is constitutive of representation should be characterized by a “relationship of identity”. For Young, the representative should not be treated as substitute for the represented. There are two main benefits of Young’s understanding of representation. First her understanding of representation encourages us to recognize the diversity of those being represented. Second her analysis of representation emphasizes the importance of recognizing how representative institutions include as well as they exclude. Democratic citizens need to remain vigilant about the ways in which providing representation for some groups comes at the expense of excluding others.

Gayatri Chakravarty Spivak and other theorists also talk about representation in one way or other. They regarded as the theorist of representation in the literary field. Spivak is well known for her representation theories of the subalterns are represented in the different canonical genres by different canonical writers.

This research dramatizes the evil impact of ethical, racial, national and collective identity created by holocaust in the movie *Life is Beautiful*. David Ludden asserts, “Subaltern groups are always subject to the activities of ruling groups ...” (RSS-304). The subaltern characters become conscious about the evil practice of caste, religion, ethnicity discrimination between high and low hierarchy.

It becomes necessary to unmask the life long struggle of Jews in Nazi code of conducts before (1939) and while the holocaust in Tuscan of Italy. All of the characters are suffering who are in margin in comparison to other only due to their race or gender is different. Subordination caused subaltern reading is essential instrument to explore the suffering of margin of the society. Paradoxical situation can be researched through the implementation of the theories of subaltern studies.

The primary objective of the study is to dig out the hidden story of marginalization of the author in order to resist against the so called elite class people in the society. Being in the same group of marginalization the director who knows and can feel more than other to draw the actual history, Spivak writes that “The proposition that only the subaltern can know the subaltern, only women can know the women and so on ...” (SSV-112). The purpose of research also uses to probe into the satire over cruel institution of Nazi ruler over Jews. Moreover the study also aims at establishing the importance of subaltern studies to redraw the history in Benigni’s movie. Michael Foucault in his essay “Power/Knowledge” writes that, “every word in history is power centered so every history is left to re-write” (14). The history should present the actual history. Subaltern has great role in the social activities but it is never addressed. History, written on the basis of a particular powerful group or person cannot be the real history, because it is not complete. There are many elements which are left while writing history. Subaltern people are always active in the formation of the every social activity but, are never addressed. They are powerless and intellectual never pay any attention to them. This makes history hollow and incomplete.

Guido, the major character of the movie and his family members are left to suffer every kind of economic hindrances, abuse and marginalization as well. Their voices are silenced due to political humiliation or lack of agency. Even Guido cannot open a book store easily without the permission of Nazi officials/authority neither can live happy conjugal life. Jews were not allowed to enter in the shop run by Nazi. The protagonist of the movie compelled to live the life of social outcast and his condition is no better than the untouchable or ‘dalit’ of the South Asian societies as the result of Jew race. They dragged to the concentration camp without any fault and compelled to survive in scarcity. Neither they get good food nor cloths and have to live in crowd and have to work and carry heavy loads in the hot chamber. They are compelled to

live apart from their parents.

Likewise all the Jews have to obey all the rules and order made by the Nazi ruler. Child and old men and women, who cannot work are sacrificed like scapegoat and shot down. Guido also shot down finally as he caught as disobedience at the end of the movie. Hence he has to sacrifice himself for his family members and ultimately able to give new birth to his family on the cost of his life. This indicates the victory over the social taboos of hierarchy. David Ludden argues, “Gramsci clearly states the history of subaltern organization ‘can only be demonstrated when ... this cycle culminates in a success, that is, in revolution’ (RSS 309). Subaltern activities are always interrupted by the activities of ruling groups and their history is episodic and fragmented but it does have existence in the historical cycle. According to Ludden:

The history of subaltern groups is necessarily fragmented and episodic. There undoubtedly does exist a tendency to unification in the historical activities of these groups but this tendency is continually interrupted by the activity of ruling groups; it therefore can only be demonstrated when a historical cycle is completed and this cycle culminates in ruling groups, even they rebel and rise up; only permanent victory breaks their subordination, and that not immediately. (RSS-305)

This movie is based on the marginalization. It seems to be appropriate to discuss about it, its nature, cause, effects and consequences in brief. It is an infamous event in human history where millions of Jews and other had to die for no reason at all. Guido, his friend Bartholomew, old men, women and even children are sacrificed. The Jews and the other people like the gypsies, homosexuals, and mentally and physically disabled people were killed mercilessly by machine-guns while many others died because their bodies just stopped working because of starvation. They couldn't get nutrition food and even abused in the camps. Today this large scale destruction and

killing of millions of Jews and other people by Hitler's Nazi Germany during World War II is even taken as the consequence of marginalization or racism. People are fighting for land and resources or an attempt to win a war to maintain their superiority in the society. In this case, millions of people were killed because they practiced a different religion and were disliked by other people. Hitler and his Nazi troops killed millions of people. The majority people are Jews, than the Non-Jews.

Hitler rose in power in Germany during 1920s and early 1930s. And he thinks of exterminate the Jews because he dislikes them. He spread the message that included the notion of 'Aryan' or white superiority and the inferiority of the other races. He made the Jews his special target of hatred and they were incorrectly represented during that time of social, and political and economic upheavals as being wealthy and in control of country's economy. He planned to eliminate all his opponents and launch the program of world domination. His government established complete political, social economic and cultural control over his subject as a totalitarian government.

At the beginning, this movie seems as a comedy but finally becomes tragic-comedy as ultimate victory become possible. From the beginning to the end. Guido and all his family include the entire Jew race, are misbehaved by the Nazi troops and ruler including all the politically powerful people in the city which is an example of the elitist authority. These people only know how to take advantage from the lower class people despite of helping them in their needs. Here Nazi also takes their advantage only as Guido serves in hotel and made satisfy. It is in the conversation between Dr. Lessing and Guido as, "Dr. Lessing: You solved it in five minutes, it took me eight days. I really enjoyed myself with you Guido, you are the cleverest waiter I have ever known" (39:5-39:15). Dr. Lessing feels very much pleased with Guido. Guido is very much helpful and fast in action.

But in need of Guido, while he was in concentration camp he couldn't get any positive response from the Nazi doctor, Dr. Lessing (Horst Buchholz) a German physician. He ignores to help Guido as, "Fat and ugly as can be and all yellow- that's me. Ask me who am I? I answer cheep, cheep! ... The answer ugly duckling right?" (1:33:22-1:33:45). Dr. Lessing denies to help Guido. He just wants to use and abuse like other Nazi. He doesn't want to take any responsibility regarding to the Jews.

Guido is a man of strong determination with courage and hard labor even though he was trapped in explaining how the race is superior in the speech while inspecting to the school. He is compelled to superiorize to the elite without any capacity to be superior of 'Aryan' and twists according to him and developed a sense of identity. It is found in Guido's speech, "naturally our race is superior ... that I was chosen, I was racist Italian scientist in order to demonstrate how superior race is ... I am an original superior race 'pure Aryan' what so big that? The ear" (22:50-23:53).

He wants to make his life on his own. For this he strives and struggles without saying day and night. To get his future bright he makes himself engaged at a hotel in the evening, where his uncle also works and serves to the people, which could be a great opportunity to win the heart of Non-Jew high rank Italian lady Dora. It becomes supporting for survival and learns to serve the people. These lines are really represents his hard work and determination. He wants to open a book shop but for this he has to get permission from the official/authority. He was ignored, his uncle was knocked down without any fault, and even they have to carry heavy load without any salary and separated from the family members and are compelled to live in dark crowdie room without any good facility but finally he is successful to fulfill his dream of life, as he can win the heart of high rank Nazi lady and at last capable to save his son and wife after the series of struggle.

Benigni has given a happy ending to this movie. At the end of the movie

Guido becomes a successful man with money as well as, can save his family from the possible harm on the cost of his life. We can observe in the Joshua and his mother's word that there is no risk any more as, "Joshua: we won! Dora: Yes we won! (1:51:55-1:52:00). Now there are no more struggles who are suffering in the hell due to being considered as a race of socially lower hierarchical rank which caused economic crisis or socially inferiority. They have happiness, courage, hope which is supposed to be only with the elite class who are socially, officially or politically powerful. Hence, Guido is successful to cross the boundary of elite/subaltern which is merely a construction of the Adolf Hitler's society of 'Aryan' to rule over the Jews (margin). Stev James asserts, "Subaltern groups are entirely hegemonized with in the dominant bloc, and other voices liquidated." Here subaltern's voices are silenced another by the hegemonic powerful group. As a creative writer/director Benigni has tried to represent the same silenced voices of Jews in the movie. This movie talks the issue of subaltern consciousness, colonialism, political chaos, violence, cultural displacement, exploitation and so on.

It has become less effective in this time of modernization (globalization). In this way Guido is able to raise the voice against any kind of suppression, discrimination, exploitation and marginalization. So he no longer has to depend upon others to be represented.

In order to analyze this movie, I have applied subaltern studies as a tool. Guido the main character of the movie is from subaltern group and become successful to fulfill his dream of having a happy and prosperous family life by his own endless effort being independent of the elite class. He is able to change his fate and achieve material success which is supposed to belong to the elite class only.

The achievement which Guido grabs is a strong proof that subaltern can do everything for their welfare and they no more need to be done by others. They are

capable of raising their voice against every kind of suppression and discrimination and marginalization. Dr. Tara Lal Shrestha writes that, “subaltern speaks in different forms” (SSS-54). He regards that they raise their voice in different way to express their idea, so there is no need to representation simply we need the knowledge to understand them. Partha Chhatterjee argues:

We have supremely paradoxical phenomenon of the low caste groups asserting their very backwardness in the caste hierarchy to claim discriminatory privileges from the state and upper caste groups proclaiming the sanctity of bourgeoisie equality and freedom [...] in order to beat the threat of their existing privileges. (SSVI-208)

How the low class Jew people are deprived from different opportunities and rights. They cannot do their own business, job, education etc.

Different critics have seen this movie via different perspective and find various themes. Benigni reveals with great courage not only how humanity suffers and inflicts untold damage upon itself, but also how it eventually repairs itself and thus sustains and survives through the darkest times. I have tried to analyze it by applying subaltern studies as a tool. Because of the nature of the protagonist's sufferings and hardships and the ultimate success, it becomes the appropriate marginalization people, making him speak against discrimination and exploitation in order to establish their existence and identity in the society without hierarchy.

Guido, the protagonist of this movie *Life is Beautiful* by Roberto Benigni is a victim of the bourgeoisie society, which is not willing to do anything on behalf of the marginal people so that they can live a life. Guido his family and Jews are victim of the bourgeoisie society which is not willing to do anything on behalf of the marginal people so that they can lived a life. Guido's family (Jews) stands for the subaltern class who are financially hard pressed and materially alienated, humiliated and

abused.

Race becomes major problem, which is also emphasized by the voice of Guido spoken the term written on Robbinhood, the horse, “Robbin Hood, what did they do to you? Look at this – they made you up! Not bad – What did they write? “Attention, Jewish horse” (37:15-37:25). This line preserves how Nazi people abused and humiliate to the Jew people without any reason and mistake made by them, and made feel humiliation in the society as the low strata and they only like them for the source of service or productive machine for them, that is the reifications for the money and usable for their pleasure any way they like.

My research uses the concept of the noted subaltern historians; it does not offer comprehensive and overall analysis of the subaltern studies and its debates. The proposed thesis will be purely textual and a library based research, it will use a close analytical style which will draw on the concept of subaltern and vocabularies. The research is based on the authentic cites. Guidance from the lecturers and professors is taken as the supportive tool, Gayatri Chakrabarty Spivak’s essay “Can the Subaltern Speak?” *Marxism and the Interpretation of the Culture*, John Beverly’s “Subalternity, Representation and Politics” *Post-colonial Studies* James Musson’s *A Triumph of the Will?* Millicent Marcus’s “The serious humor of La Vita e bella” David Ludden’s *Reading Subaltern Studies*, Antonio Gramsci’s *The Prison Notebook* and third world theorists will be drawn into the debate while examining the movie. The subaltern historians and theorist like Dipesh Chakrabarty, Ranjit Guha, Edward Said, Michael Foucault and other will be brought into conversation to examine the subaltern silence and muted histories of minority Jews to make the analysis of the movie in order to prove hypothesis. The different extracts of the movie are taken to prove the hypothesis. In addition intend to borrow the ideas from Toby Miller and Robert Stan’s “Film Theory” also including in the research.

The present research will develop from introduction in the first chapter. It will be followed by a discussion of subaltern studies as a tool to apply in this movie. Moreover, my attempt will focus and analyze the struggle and the achievement of the subaltern people to live a meaningful life in the society in the third chapter. Similarly, conclusion and works cited will be in the fourth and fifth chapter respectively.

II. Subaltern Consciousness in Benigni and Cerami's *Life is Beautiful*

Writer/director/actor has used dominant marginal attitude indirectly in comic representation changing their fate and raising their voice to present subaltern's silenced, scattered, muted voice to redraw the history, which is written only praising elites or center. He wants to make history actual and contextual. Subalterns are no more marginalized, because there is no particular center. Everyone has their own history and it is important for them. Dr. Tara Lal Shrestha writes that:

Human are the creator of the history. Every people carry the special history, but personal history also connected with the society. Every history is valuable. The history of special moment is even invaluable. So people cannot forgot their past forever. He loves history though it may be bitter and revolves round it time and again. (XVI)

Subaltern studies can be defined as a theory of change. And it questions to the central history, which is filled with elite ideology. This study that's why is very much influenced by postmodernism and post structuralism. Cultural studies are getting much more attention from all sides. Subaltern studies recently deals also with the issue of representation critical theory and cultural studies from subaltern politics. The term 'subaltern' is used to denote the entire people that are subordinate in terms of class, caste, age, gender and office or in any other way. In the definition of prominent subaltern historiographer Ranjit Guha: "The word 'subaltern'... stands for the meaning as given in the Concise Oxford Dictionary that is 'of inferior rank'. It will be used ... as a name for the general attitude of subordination in South Asian Society whether this is expressed in terms of class, caste, age, gender, and office or in any other way" (VII). Though Guha proposes the use of the term subaltern for the South Asian subordinate populations crushed under the neo-colonial hegemonic discourse it can be used for the populations around the world with similar experiences of

hegemony. Subaltern lacks the agency in the society due to their lower rank in the hierarchy of social system in terms of class, caste, gender, age, office, and or any other way. The phrase “any other way”, gives the term flexibility so that it could accommodate the variety of the forms of the hegemony. The lower rank of Guido’s family in the socio-economic hierarchy is clearly high-lights their subalternity.

The very word subaltern was first used to refer vassals and peasants in medieval period. By 1700, it was used to stand for the lower ranks in military suggesting them as peasant origin. By 1800, the writers and the historians started writing the text and the script of the movie and histories about military campaign in India and America from the subaltern perspective Later on the very term got a rather authentic voice when Antonio Gramsci in his book *Prison Notebook* adopted the term to refer those groups in any society “who are subject to the hegemony of the ruling classes” (76). Peasant wonders and also other groups may fall under the term subalterns who are denied access to hegemonic power. These subaltern classes are forced to stay away from the hegemonic power and suffer the exploitation of the ruling classes.

The term 'subaltern' refers to the marginalized or oppressed people whether in terms of class, caste, age, religion, ethnicity and gender. The most prominent violation perpetrated over the subaltern people are the effacement of their identity in the official representation. The subalterns are marginalized thinking that they cannot speak though they are aware of the suppression or marginalization. This is even supported by Gayatri Chakravarti Spivak in her essay “Deconstructing Historiography” writes “... subaltern cannot appear without the thought of the elite” (SSVI-339). They lack the language of their own which can express their pain and sufferings. Not only the language but also the theoretical strategies they lack there by the marginalization

become an ongoing process. But later she presents another view that it was from the Marx's concept as subaltern were not active in France so they can't present their words for them, others should speak. On the basis of this Spivak presents her theory that intellectual should speak for those who are unable to speak themselves.

Later Spivak argues that subaltern can speak simply we are unable to understand. Dr. Tara Lal Shrestha writes, "In literature subaltern speaks in different forms" (SSS-54).

There are two types of views related to the question that either the subaltern people can raise their voice by themselves or they need to be represented by others. On the one hand there are some critics like Spivak who believe that the subaltern subjects have been regulated to the position of subjects rather than participants in a two way dialogue. They are made only the subjects so they cannot speak. They have to be represented by the elite intellectuals because only the intellectual elites can present interpretation of the subaltern voice filtered through the intellectual view-point. It is all because they "have no history and cannot speak" (Spivak 32). The subaltern is the marginalized one which has no access to hegemonic power. So they lack the means as well as strategy of their own.

Moreover they do not have the privileged position from where they can express themselves. Therefore the spokesperson of subaltern members becomes their life giver and master Spivak argues, "The small peasant proprietors cannot represent themselves: they must be presented. Their representation must appear simultaneously as their master, as an authority over them as unrestricted governmental power that protects them from the other classes and sends them rain and sunshine from above" (Spivak 29-30).

When the authority ignores the subaltern people, they constitute a continuing form of protest by acting together in small bonds, against it. Even though there are

two types of distinct views regarding the voice of subaltern I do believe that the subalterns are capable of raising their voice against every kind of suppression in this modern age though they needed to be represented by others in the past. This movie is an example that subalterns can make their identity sure without depending on others. From the Gayatri Chakravarty Spivak says that, “Yet with the case of the subaltern, one must first decide to recognize the language of communication as a valid mode. In other words west must try hard to listen to people in all of their forms of communication. The subaltern speaks all the time: We are simply unable to hear them” (437). Spivak explains that subaltern can speak but they are speaking in different way. We need to know the language and behavior first to listen and understand them.

The colonialism was no doubt, against the will and wish of the people. This is for Gramsci ‘hegemony’. He writes that in his *Prison Note book* “Hegemony is such a social situation, where everything is directed by the powerful group” (35). Here he refers to no space for the subaltern’s wish. They resisted it with great courage and hope but the colonial historiography simply observes their resistance and always busy in proving the British rule as based on people's wish and will. It undermines their resistance and always busy in proving the British rule as based on peoples wish and will. It undermines their political sensibility. It means elite or authority always tries to prepare different rule and policies to rule in one way or other.

There was remarkable participation of the subaltern people in the great anti-imperialist movements like civil disobedience, Non-cooperation and Quit India. But the actions and deeds of these people were simply ignored by the elite/center or authority. Here in this movie the punishment is also presented in humorous way by Guido but Nazi ruler never pay any attention. In the announcement and translation of the Corporal’s order by Guido as “SS. Corporal: Any sabotage is punishable by death

sentence ... here back in the yard by machine gun in the back! Guido: Every morning the loudspeaker announced number whoever is last has to wear a sign that said “Jackass” –here in his back” (1:7:0-1:7:20).

The subaltern people resisted the bourgeoisie nationalists as well as indigenous elite leaders by disobeying their orders. They would take part in the anti-imperialist movements in their own traditionalist way. They would derive the terms from the idioms of their everyday life so that they could make these struggles their own. So Guido denies to be obeying the order as “we are going to die here! I can’t take any more! I’m putting this down. I will tell them I can’t do it. What can they do to me?” (1:11:26-1:13:00). Hence "defiance" is not only characteristic behavior of the subaltern classes but also submissiveness to authority "equally important feature of their behaviors” (Bhadra 54).

The subaltern groups tend to protest the elite domination. But sometimes they are misrepresented by the intellectual elite, who leave them on the middle of the path making them unknown where to head. It is in this context that we must understand the meaning of the autonomous domain of subaltern moments and their consciousness. We are in a situation where elites remain dominant without having the will or the ability to transform society while the counterthrust from subaltern group is perpetually thwarted or subaltern by elite domination. The need for co-existence and peace between people of the two groups is obvious. The occasional convergence of interest between various upper and lower casts and occupational group cannot be viewed in isolation.

According to Gayanendra Pandey “If we talk about Hindu -Muslim relation during 1888-1917 they bound themselves neither to "interfere” in the religious practices of the other community not to "introduce any change “in the established customs” (Pandey128). Such type of agreement is really necessary to maintain peace

and harmony in every society. But it is not practiced and caused misunderstanding between and among the different race, color, gender, ethnic group or any other.

The subaltern class believes that those who hold power over them whether money lenders grain traders, land holders or officials, should not abuse their power but be responsive to subaltern needs. So the protest is accordingly directed not to overturn the super ordinate classes but to reminding them of the proper use of their power. In this movie Guido also expects from Dr. Lessing, some help, means he also accept them as responsible for them to help indeed.

This movie *Life is Beautiful* can be taken as a strong proof that the subaltern is not the subaltern lifelong. The subaltern people are equally capable of doing everything to make their life as well as economic standard better. This is supported by Gayatri chakravarty Spivak in “Can the Subaltern Speak?” as:

Yet the subaltern is never engaged qua the subaltern, and the western subject is never addressed Vis a Vis the subaltern. In other words, the subaltern can speak as long as they speak in a “language” that is already recognized by the dominant culture of the west. Reason and rational communication mediated via the market or the academy, prevail as the Meta language, and the subaltern are forced to compete in a bazaar of ideas where the deck is stacked against them by years of colonial rule. Yet in the face or the silence of the subaltern, the West (often) seeks to synthesize and systematize, as if we learned nothing from Nietzsche. Instead of recognizing as Spivak asserts that logical contradictions embody the richest forms of knowledge, the western scholar and even many post-colonial thinker keep attempting to synthesize, and speak for the subaltern. (431)

Here Spivak argues that subaltern is never engaged quo the subaltern they are also

capable but the westerner or intellectual also should take subaltern's indirect and muted voice in consideration.

In the world of modernization people either they are the elite or the subaltern. They do have same kind of wish and will to possess the benefit of advanced science and technology. It is a human nature that demands and necessities are endless. In the process of completion of demands of life subaltern no more needs the help of the elite as in the past. Time has passed a lot changes are uncountable. Subaltern are strong enough to hold their voice against any kind of discrimination suppression exploitation and marginalization. They are no more a parasite they have changed themselves as an active and alert actor of their deeds. Spivak argues that, "The subaltern study [...] perceives their task as making a theory of consciousness or culture rather than specifically a theory of change" (330). Spivak here is very much concerned about the problematic dealing of the elite to the subaltern. Her essay "Can the Subaltern Speak?" (1998) has raised the issue related to the welfare of the subaltern people, though it is hotly debated everywhere and gets different ideas.

Guido, being main character which belongs to inferior class in the so called superior society is successful to fulfill his dream of happy and prosperous life by his own efforts and continuous labor. From his character we can say that subaltern can make or change their fate by themselves. They can bring bright light or make bright future independent of the elite. In one sentence they need not to be represented by others anymore. But their history should be redrawn by themselves to make the actual history which is scattered, silenced, or misrepresented, because the actual history is only possible to write by the subaltern only. Then only subaltern can feel as their own history, if intellectual or elites writes than the history only become filtered according to their benefit or wish. Spivak writes that, "The proposition that only the subaltern can know the subaltern" (SSV-112). Here she refers to the relation of sympathy and

empathy. The subaltern's history is only possible if subaltern's view or voice is represented. If the history is written by intellectual the history will be filtered and may not address the actual voice of margin.

Roberto Benigni's movie *Life is Beautiful* presents the voice of subaltern not only as the resistance against the dominant class ideology, but also to subvert such an elitist ideology for their self-representation through Jew hero Guido and his family members struggle and success to have a happy and prosperous family life. In the movie Benigni shows the Herculean efforts of the main character Guido and his family to keep the family ties strong. The characters portrayed as the subaltern characters have courage, hope, and energy and struggle not less than the elite.

Guido is a hero with full of energy and strong determination which he proves from beginning to the end of the movie. Guido is a character, who comes to Tuscan of Italy in search of better future. He wanted to open a book shop to be independent and to cope of himself as his own stability dignity and economically powerful. But due to domination, exploitation suppression, oppression and humiliation of elites he couldn't do. He is very much clever and intellect to handle the situation without taking the hindrance as the serious matter but handles easily as the minor problem for him to be cross. So he takes his determination as the core to get success over the exploitation, and domination.

Guido's uncle is knocked down but he couldn't react against those bad youth, because he thinks they are inferior and incapable to react against this hegemonic feature is found in the conversation between Guido and his Uncle as "Guido: Are you hurt? Why didn't you cry for help? Uncle: Silence is the loudest cry! Come here you two" (00: 06: 25-00: 06:30). This indicates they are hegemonized though they know it like Gramsci defines hegemony by force. But Guido having the sense of determinism and optimism he do every ends and means to get success over, so he tries his best to

win the heart of Nazi's and ultimately capable as well. But for this success he had to face many hardships. Nazi takes Jews as the worthless race. They don't allow to enter in the shop as out-cast. It is perceived in the Joshua and Guido's conversation as, "Joshua: Why aren't Jews or dogs allowed in the shop, Daddy? Guido: Well they don't want Jews or dogs!"(50:30-50:50). This conversation shows that how the elite are misbehaving the people as less than human.

Guido loves a high rank lady who is from non-Jewish but was not allowed to marry with Guido as being from lower cast. But due to his funny and clever nature he can win the heart of Dr. Lessing as well. In this movie Guido wants to open a book shop but he has to take the permission from the Nazi officials/authority this indicates to the elite, but they never pay any attention towards his nomination/proposal letter and the officials ignore to sign or tries to delay and make him to attempt again and again.

Guido tries many times to convince but they ignored. And for this success he had to face much hardship. Nazi takes Jews as the worthless race and only Nazi or Aryan was the superior, but Guido misguides the explanation of the superiority of the race only cast that is Nazi or Aryan. He loves a high rank non-Jewish Italian lady Dora, so she was not allowed to marry. This action made her sacrificed with Jew hero Guido, who is considered as lower rank in social strata due to only their race.

Guido is funny and clever he can win the heart of Lady Dora and win from the hand of Nazi fiancé though he has to struggle with many hindrances, and even finally get success to marry her. This shows the subaltern can do everything if they have determination, hope and courage. Likewise even Guido is capable to win the heart of Nazi people like Dr. Lessing and even school inspector. This is also proved from the dialogue of Dr. Lessing:

What are these flowers? Guido: for you, for your departure! Dr.

Lessing, I will take one. I'll bring it to my wife- a Guido flower. I really enjoyed myself with you, Guido. You are the cleverest waiter I've ever known. By the way if you say my name I disappear. Who am I? Guido: Thank you doctor. And you are the most cultured guest I have ever served. (39:00-39:42)

This dialogue presents the theme that subaltern are also capable to do everything, which is utilized by elite as social troops for rule and to maintain their luxurious life in the society. Subaltern are always active in the action but they are presented passive in the history, though they contributed to move the society ahead.

In this movie Guido wants to open a book store but he has to take the permission from the Nazi officials but they never pay any attention towards his proposals and the officials ignore to sign or tries to delay and make him to attempt again and again. This indicates the symbol of elite to ignore the disabled or subaltern. Guido tries many times to convince, but they ignored.

Elite only consume the benefit of subaltern but never helps. So subaltern should do for themselves. At first Benigni tries his best to serve the elite in the hotel and he expects from them some help but get nothing, this is shown in the dialogue between Guido and one of his friends Bartholomew in the concentration camp like as, "This is a loony bin! They all crazy! The doctor, the captain there –I knew him when I was a waiter. He says they're giving a dinner here for the officials and their wives and he told me I have to serve at the dinner. May be he want to help me he might get us out of here." (1:21:40-1:22:04)

The above line explains that subaltern always seeks for the help of elite, if they would help them. More over Guido expects from the Dr. Lessing to rescue him from the grip of Nazi, which further clarifies the relatively marginalized Jews fact associated with the character of Guido.

According to Spivak the subaltern becomes unable to raise their voice despite being in the position of raising the voice. In the above line Guido (Jews) unable to raise the voice against the Nazi, Dr. Lessing to solve the problem.

And the elite' selfish nature can be shown from the dialogue of Dr. Lessing:

Fat and ugly as can be, and all yellow—that's me. Ask me what I am I answer cheap, cheep! When I walk I make poppo' so who am I do you know? The answer 'Ugly Duckling' right? It is the Ugly Duckling –but it's not! I haven't slept in four months. A veterinarian friend sent it to me from Vienna, and I can't send him mine until I solve this one! "Fat and ugly as can be"—it has to be the Ugly Duckling. But he said it isn't! So what is it? I thought may be a platypus, but it doesn't say cheep cheep! platypus goes fr... fr...(1:33:22-1:34)

The above line spoken by Dr. Lessing preserves that the elite only consume the benefit of subaltern but never helped they consider them as the docile, fragile object to please and serve them. So subaltern should do for themselves...

Though this movie can be divided into two part first parts seems to be comic representation of holocaust through the misrepresentation of horrific holocaust, but second part seems to be traumatic and every part is concentrated towards the subalternity. The critical situation is presented very lightly with full of comic representation.

In the second part Joshua reads the notice which was written on a shop and asks to his father Guido why they had written this on the shop wall:

Joshua: Why aren't Jews or dogs allowed in the shop, Daddy? Guido: Well, they don't want Jews or dogs. People do as they please! There is a hardware store over there they won't let Spaniards or horses in. And what's—his name, who has the drugstore just yesterday I was standing

there with a Chinese friend and his pet kangaroo. “No, no Chinese or Kangaroos allowed!” He doesn’t like them. (50:30-51:16)

This indicates how elite class people (Nazi) discriminates dominates and made Jews as socially inferior rank than human and humiliates and compare with the dog which are not allowed to enter as if they bother them. They considered them as the outcast of the society in South Asian ‘dalit’ Guido tries his best to pull up their family from the mire of poverty, insecurity and ruin. In spite of their suffering they maintain their corporation for the family loyalties and social responsibilities.

Guido misguides his child to make him not to be affected from the discrimination and domination of elites as he thinks that his child is innocent. He fooled to the Nazi German though he has to face much hardship in the concentration camp. Guido is determined to release his family from the trap of Nazi concentration camp. His wife Dora also urged to go in concentration camp to be with her family but she is taken apart from the jeans but she determined to suffer in camp though she was not Jew and she goes there, compelled to work hard and live in dark concentration camp. This show how painful is the victimization.

The children, women and all olds of the marginalized groups are suffering too much. These lines describe the picture of their hardship as, “Dora: At least old women and children don’t have to work. May be..., Gigliola: Listen the old women and children don’t work because the Germans are going to kill them all. One of these days they will call them for a shower “ Children shower time” but the shower room here ..., is the gas chamber” (1:14:15-1:14:25). And not only the child and old women but all the Jews are suffering in the concentration camp. “Guido: This has to weigh on hundred kilos! It must be three thousand degrees in here. I can’t do it, Vittorio, I can’t cope any more. Vittorio, after only the first one? Guido: Why are there more to move Vittorio: We’re here until tonight!” (1:9:39-1:10:20). These all presents the critical

situation of the subaltern in the rule of the elite in the name of their personal jealousy. Jews become the revenge troop in the hand of Nazi ruler Hitler. Jews' life becomes no more than hell.

Subaltern thinks of revolt but due to lack of power or agency they couldn't do anything. Likewise the conversation between Guido and Bartholomew also indicates the hard work in the concentration camp and even unable to deny the work though they don't want to do due to lack of power, agency or social system in favor of them:

Guido: Bartholomew, what happened? Where they taking you?

Bartholomew: To the hospital, I hurt my arm. Guido: We are going to die here! I can't take it anymore! I'm putting this down I'll tell them I can't do it. What can they do to me?

Vittorio: They will kill you. Guido: Good Lord I'll Guido:

Bartholomew, what happened? Where are they taking you?

Bartholomew: To the hospital. I hurt my arm. Guido: We are going to die here! I can't take it anymore! I'm putting this down never make it.

It's got to be ten thousand degrees in here. (1:11:25-1:13:33)

Subaltern's suffering and elite's consideration of subaltern as fragile and docile objects to make money and play like puppet. Here Guido tries to revolt by denying to work, but as Bartholomew suggests that Nazi will kill, then he become conscious that he doesn't has any power to revolt against and compelled to obey the order.

This inhuman behavior of the elites can be presented from the Joshua, "They make buttons and soap out of us ... They cook us in the oven... A man was crying and he said they make buttons and soap out of us... Which kid? There aren't any more kids I'm the only one left" (1:22:50-1:24:00).

These lines are really show the sympathetic condition of class subaltern showing how much they have been crushed by elitist ideology in the racist and capitalist society.

The family has no way to be out of the racist problem. There is no sense of human and humanity, they are used as if the means of economy as productive machine.

Guido is suffering from the problem of survival. He is full of hope and courage. It is in fact hope and courage that makes him successful to bring about happiness in his family. Guido, his uncle and son Joshua all are from Jew race dragged into the concentration camp and, make compelled to survive in dark crowdie place where Jews has to work very hard, though they are very weak but compelled to carry heavy loads. Those who are child or old are shot down as they are worthless only due to being considered as subaltern (Jews).

All the Jews are separated from their family as ladies are kept in different place and jeans and old and boys are also in different place, but Joshua lives with his father, hiding time and again. And Guido disguise his child as playing hide and seek for the first prize which become the clever and bravery of the determined Jew's fit for the better future. Guido is from the subaltern group/bottom strata of the society. He is living a life of scarcity. But he is striving for his identity for his own image and meaningful existence in the society. The most important formula they accept is “to be hopeful we can find the philosophy of optimism and positive attitude towards life in the character Guido in his dialogue:

Guido: Where are we? I took a wrong turn, Joshua. Oh good –you’re asleep. Pleasant dreams may be, it’s really all a dream. Just a dream Joshua... Tomorrow morning Mommy’s going to wake us up with a nice cup of warm milk and some cookies. First we’ll eat then I’ll make love to her two or three times... if I can. (56:50-57:47)

These lines present the optimistic vision or hope from behind the darkness of holocaust. Likewise the same view is seen in the Joshua and Bartholomew’s voice as:

Bartholomew: They must have called those two officers to

headquarters at least twenty times. They're long gone. (The German are going) The war's over. They're running away.

Guido: So what about us? What happens to us? Bartholomew: Who knows? They've taken about fifty truckloads of prisoners away. Either they are going to kill us all or...don't know. Guido: Good bye

Bartholomew—see you in Viar eggio. We'll start our own business: an anvil company! Bartholomew: I've been hearing machine-gun fire and dogs barking for the last six hours, they don't want to leave any traces.

(1:39:15-1:40:00)

In the case of Guido it is obviously hope and passion that energizes him to cope up the miserable situation. Anyone who ever sees his family condition feels sympathy. They are unable to fulfill the basic needs like food, cloth and shelter. Neither the shelter nor the food is good. The food they eat is far worse than the dog of the elites eaten.

There was nothing to eat. Guido brings a little piece of bread for his child and to make him calm. He bounds with the rules as the rules of game that they have to follow. The rule to hide not to ask for home food and crying, if anyone do so then he will lose the game. This clever idea of Guido helps him to hide his child from the killing and coming Harm on them, but in the contrary elite has got delicious and enough food. They are enjoying party, this is even find in the inspector's voice as, "Inspector: ... meat, a nice rich steak or lamb or kidney shape bread or fish ..." (18:40-18:50). And their babies are playing games, eating delicious food whatever they like, and on the contrary Joshua is busy to hide from the Nazi ruler. These all shows elite's enjoying and subalterns suffering.

Guido a victim of elite class does not think evens the consequences that he will catch by the Nazi soldiers. He simply thinks that he will get a way of escapement

and save his family and fulfilling the needs of his family. This determined nature makes him success. The survival becomes the major problem in their life.

Though marriage is considered as a holly bondage which gives hopes and happiness, it becomes a burden to the subaltern class, because it needs money/wealth to buy material things in order to fulfill the demand of family members. The painful situation, which Guido undergoes, is not different. He does have one child wife and his old uncle to take the responsibility for survival.

The freedom of choice is not found in the case of the subaltern class. It is because they are not the policy makers. They are not guaranteed to make the choice according to their wish and necessity. Knowingly or unknowingly, they are compelled to do with certain things though that is not enough to complete his needs. This is supported by the Gramsci's notion that hegemony is not forceful but also from special social norms and system which helps to get consent (35).

Here Nazi compelled them to do the activities that they like by force. Despite the fact that, there are only a few possibilities, Guido hopes to get choice in the job opportunities in Italy that is in the process of industrialization, so that he comes there for job. And because of industrialization he can change his situation by exchanging labor for money. He makes his destination to Italy, to overcome the horrific situation, but he is misbehaved, humiliated and abused everywhere. Even the government officials who are responsible for the service of people always ignores to those who are marginalized, innocent disabled or minority. The bad treatment of officials upon Guido and the humiliation of the policemen show that how the innocent and marginalization are dealt with by the authority in a society. Hence the extract as follows reflects the fact:

Guido: I would like to fill out all the necessary forms to open a book store. Will it take long? Secretary: Now? It's nearly one, we are

closing soon. Come back this afternoon. Guido: I can't, my uncle has to give me waitering lessons.

Secretary: Than come back tomorrow. In the mean time, you have to fill out a formal application, which our town clerk has to sign...,

Guido: Fill it out, we'll get him to sign right away write: the undersigned, Guido, hereby applies...,

Secretary: But he can't sign it immediately!

Guido: Here he is, here he is! Dr. Rodolfo: What's going on here?

Guido: I need your signature to open my book store –one little signature! Dr. Rodolfo: I can't, my replacement will be here in an hour ask him. Guido: But it's just a signature right? Dr. Rodolfo: We close at one. Got it?

Guido: But it's only ten to one! Dr. Rodolfo: File a complaint! (9:18-10:16)

This dialogue indicates that subalterns are doing continuous effort to get better position and never has any leisure to enjoy but to deny the position elite or the center always ignores to do in favor of the margin for this they use their complete power, knowledge, rule, and politics to exclude the presence of the subaltern.

He is a man of self-respect. He feels very much hurt when the German government officials jeers at him and the military also throws them in the train to concentration camp being a member of the state authority, the officials as well the military power both misuses their power over the marginalized people like Guido's family including all the Jews in spite of helping them in their need.

Benigni's sense of satire is scattered all over this movie. Here he intentionally satirizes to the government how the state is irresponsible to the margin and acting as the role of vampire observing the blood and sweats of poor's indirectly. This

intellectuality to avoid the harm and get in point that always exploits the citizens and survives on the sweat and work of its citizen. It is even admired by some critique like Millicent Marcus and James Musson. Marcus argues in “The Serious Humor of *La Vita e bella*” has appreciated and appropriated the use of humor in the movie ‘*Life is Beautiful*’ is presented as a fantastical yet acknowledges it’s message to future generations ... In sum, the film effectively fuses humor and the holocaust into a “ground breaking film” (153). Marcus praise the indirect presentation of the evil impact of the racism which may harmful and comic presentation can be appropriate way to make the people aware and the state responsible for its work or service.

James Musson in her criticism “A Triumph of the Will?” supports the movie as “[...] you may be able to see why *Life is Beautiful* has attracted criticism-slapstick laugh in a holocaust film? – But the humor in this film is not for entertainment. It makes a profound point about the way human may react in the most adverse circumstances. And how we protect our internal life when our external world is so bleak” (13). He means for human should have consciousness to the presentation of their view. We should utilize our internal knowledge if we are in problem to get rid of. Here he praises that the situation was so bleak and to make his self-satisfaction.

In fact the government should take the responsibility regarding its citizens. The government should play the role of a guardian but instead it exploits suppresses the people especially the marginalized group. On the other hand it uses the lands of its citizens forcefully and dominates them as worthless people. It can be evidently observed in the following term character:

SS. Corporal’s announcement: Attention I’m only going to say this once!
 Guido: Okay, the game begins! If you’re here, you’re here, you’re here.
 Corporal: You are here for one reason and one reason only.
 Guido: The first one to get a thousand points wins a real tank.

Corporal: To work! Guido: Lucky man. Corporal: Any sabotage is punishable by death sentence carried out right here in the yard, by machine-gun in the back! Guido: Scores will be announced every morning on the loudspeakers outside! Whoever is last has to wear a sign that says "Jackass" –here on his back! Corporal: You are privileged to work for over great Germany, building our great empire! Guido: We play the mean guys the ones who yell! Whoever scared loses points! Corporal: There are three very important rules. One: Never attempt escape, Two: Obey all orders without asking questions. Three: Any attempt at organized riot will be punished by hanging. Is that clear? ... Obey orders. (1:6:58-1:9:14)

Here the margins are compelled to obey the rule prepared by elites, whether it is suitable for the subaltern or not, they are to be followed. The government simply ignores the disagreements, protest revolt, thinking feeling and the sentiment of the subaltern people. It acts according to its wish and will without realizing the fact that the subaltern people are also the citizen of the same state and they have paid the tax to the government and they have completed their duty towards the government. In the same way the government does have its responsibility towards the citizens, which, should be fulfilled without discrimination in the name of class, caste, gender, ethnicity or any other way. Guido fights very hard to sustain the family together.

Guido thinks that by going Italy he will make a lot of money, bring riches, pieces of gold and silver for bright future. But when he reaches to Italy he becomes disappointed because he is misbehaved everywhere. He is haunted by the loneliness and identity crisis. He thinks that it is all because of his low class (marginalized position). The ill-treatment towards the subaltern class people is seen when he reaches to the uncle's home and found his uncle knocked down, some Nazi people colored the

Robbin hood the horse. Like-wise in the office the clerk ignores to sign. Elite humiliate as, “Guido: Robbinhood, what did they do to you! Not bad–what did they write? “Attention Jewish horse”. Uncle: Barbarians! Vandals! It’s so sad. What nonsense. “Jewish horse” Did you ever?” (37:14-38:00).

This shows how the center or elite group misbehaved on those who are disabled and can’t react against them. We can easily guess the suffering and hard times of Guido as a member of a marginalized group. He becomes a wanderer, wandering for a job to sustain his life as well as for his bright future. Guido a representative of subaltern class lacks the economic power. He doesn't have any hope. It becomes very hard to sustain his livelihood. In materialist and modern world, nothing can be done without money. Money and cast deserves much more value than the human sentiments. He frankly states that how the race is superior while the time of inspecting at school and compelled to describe how a race is superior.

It means he wants to exchange his future. Really the condition of Guido is very sympathetic. He explores his helplessness without hiding anything before the man. The subaltern are knowingly or unknowingly marginalized everywhere. So they are compelled to derive pleasure and happiness out of just simple survival. They cannot dream beyond the boundary of their survival. To join their hands to mouth and conservation of racial dignity becomes the main and common problem of these groups.

Guido believes on his own labor. He does have strong determination that he can change his fortune through his own efforts. He wants to create his own identity. For this he doesn't lose any trace. He makes constant efforts to improve his family condition. He keeps in his mind that nothing remains constant-everything changes-his condition. He devotes himself in his work keeping in his mind that "everything changes” (210). With great hope and energy, he tries his best to overcome every sort

of difficulties like in Guido's voice, "The eating house never quite shut and customers had to be served with tea and bread and lentils whenever they demanded it. Day or night" (37:21-37:-30). These words suggest his suffering and pain.

Food cloth and shelter are the basic needs of human beings. These things are the foundation of life without which we cannot survive. But the shelter of the subaltern people reflected by these lines is damp and muddy. They should spend the day and with single clothes in the lack of substitution. In such a condition too he never becomes hopeless and diverted from his determination. Instead the more he suffers the hardships the bolder he becomes. He learns to fight his way out for his survival at every turns and becomes a man.

Another tormenting situation of his family can be counted through the Nazi rulers that have to be obeyed, or shot down. Due to the scarcity of good food many Jews are suffering from different kinds of disease, because balance diet is out of their reach. Ultimately their health condition becomes as weak as their economic condition. Benigni truly presents the life of those subaltern groups through the medium of the physical appearance of the people while checking health of the Jew prisoners.

Guido is a developing character that is on the process of becoming. He seeks change and promotion with full of energy. As a member of the poor and minority class Guido is bound to work a lot. He wants to stand on his own foot. He looks forward to spending the life with prestige and human dignity as does the elite group after the ignorance of Dr. Lessing he tries his best to escape from the camp and hide his son in the small broken shelf and search his wife on his own from the crowd. There he calls "Is there anyone called Dora here? Dora! Are you here? It's Guido" (1:44:05-1:44:06). But nobody speaks. So, he rushes outside and finds out that the women prisoner being transported somewhere else. His worries more than before and shots her name more loudly running after the running truck. He says "Is there a Dora

here? She is Italian. She's my wife." But another woman named Dora speaks "Yes, there is Dora here, it's me, Dora!" again he makes the woman clear that she is not Dora whom he was calling for. He says "It's not her! Is there another Dora? Jump out of the truck as soon as you can! Get off! Jump out!!(1:44:10-1:45:50).

Here we can see the change in the thinking of the main character, Guido at the beginning he was funnier selfish fraud and weak that he was unable to make a decision. But his struggle for existence has made him bolder than before. He is now mentally grownup and strong enough of making decision and choices on his own. So he feels independent and starts something on his own. He wants to be free from the exploitation suppression and marginalization of the elite class. He can search/find much more possibilities after the release from the camp in future.

Now he has courage as well as knowledge to do the work. After having both courage and knowledge it will not be tough to survive. It is also supported by the words of optimistic view point with his friend Bartholomew that he would do a job for better life. This can be listened in his dialogue with Bartholomew as "Good bye Bartholomew –see you in Viareggio, we will start our own business: on anvil company" (1:39:15-1:39:30).

Hence his effort to release himself from the boundary made by the elites of the society as binary relationship between one race and another where one race as superior than the other little number of minority race. Race and money matter not humanity displays his courage, psychological development and the symptoms of his bright future. Guido opens his own stationary in second part and after his sacrifice his child Joshua and wife Dora are released from the concentration camp. It shows that he has improved his economic and racial empowerment. These lines are the proof of his success " Voice over (adult Joshua): This is my story. This is the sacrifice my father made. This was his gift to me. "Joshua: We won! Dora: Yes we won! Joshua: A

thousand points! Couldn't you just laughing? We came in first! We get to take the tank home! We won!" (01:51:55- 01:52:03).

At the end of the movie Joshua cheers as they (subaltern) get ultimate victory over the social discrimination and exploitation though after the long time span and efforts.

Guido makes himself engaged, without saying day or night to cross the boundary made by the elite society and also to meet the necessities of his life. In this way he proves that subaltern can change their condition without depending on the elites.

People who are economically poor and racially inferior group cannot get rich and balance the superiority over night. David Ludden writes, "Subaltern groups are always subject to the activity of ruling groups. Even they rebel and rise up; only permanent victory breaks their subordination and that not immediately" (RSS-305). Ludden claims that marginal are always dominated, so to break complete boundary and make harmonious society one there should be complete change in the level of mind then only it becomes possible.

One should have hope patience and courage to improve or change his fate and status. There is an unbridgeable gap in the way of living, earning, thinking and so on between the so called elite and the subaltern. In every sector the subaltern is knowingly or unknowingly marginalized. They are victimized in every social sector. To get the same thing, the marginalized group has to do more struggles. Another important thing of Guido is that his suffering, experience and his hard labor has made him a man who can tolerate any kind of pain. He is hopeful that his future will be better. He believes in his labor and devotion.

Guido is hopeful that he will be able to save his family which will be upcoming harm upon them. And his family would live peacefully in future with their own voice, dignity, and prestige which help him to come up with and struggle for the

meaningful existence.

In this movie Roberto Benigni reflected the corrupt nature and the behavior of the authority clearly that they do support the status quo of the society. They seem to exploit the subaltern groups due to the fact that authority or politicians constitutes the policies which strengthen the position of the elites and endangering the life of the subalterns, who indeed want to live on their own. It is evident in the text that the life Jew people exposes the bitter reality. They do not have seen and expected the world beyond it. They are enjoying, what they are. The minority races are uneducated or silenced because of their lack of power or means media and authority, as a result they cannot protest against the authority. So they express their worry about the change going to happen in the society. They cannot raise their voice, protest towards the domination, exploitation and, marginalization. The following extract can work as evidence:

Uncle: Barbarians! Vandals! It's so sad. What nonsense "Jewish horse"
 Did you ever? Guido: Forget it, Uncle, they did it to— Uncle: No, no,
 they didn't do it to ... they did it to... Guido: On me! What can they do
 to me? The worst they can do is strip me paint me yellow, and write,
 "Attention Jewish waiter" come, let's go Uncle. I didn't know the
 horse was Jewish .I will clean him up for you tomorrow morning,
 okay? (37:20-38:19)

Hence the subaltern's acceptance of the order or to be ruled though they know the domination, exploitation. And even can't raise their voice against the power due to lack of means, authority etc. Innocent and ignorant race become unhappy and expose themselves against the majority, so called high class race or elite and authority. They love their own culture, lifestyle, heritage clothing, food, their own characteristics rather than the domination, exploitation of other race and superiorization of dominant

culture. They know that the others culture will not be in the favor of the marginalized race of the poor villager's. Although they are illiterate they know the corrupt nature of the politicians who use the marginal as a ladder and reach the apex of success marginalizing the devotion of these people.

In the case of Guido he has learned and understood that the minority race is also equally important and capable. All his efforts and energy spent in, it has become water in the sand. He can see no traces of improved condition. So he is convinced to change the binary of race into the balance. He makes his mind to change his racial survival by engaging in the justifying (explaining) how the race is superior is which could help him to be a successful man. He is successful too in his determination. He is now no more confused person. He is so confident that he can fight all sorts of hazards, which may come in his path of success. His high enthusiasm and positive thinking energizes him to move ahead in his profession and the entire future plan. The ultimate gain of Guido is highly notable. His constant labor to achieve his goal of life is acceptable and assimilative as it enlightens the life of all family members which inspires them to do better in future.

Guido has proved that the subalterns are not the subalterns all the time. They too have the energy and capacity to change their position by their own efforts. They can do each and every thing for themselves. There is no need to be represented by the so called elites. But it is necessary to bring change in the thinking of the people who are rooted in the traditional thinking and behavior. The subaltern can keep their voice against all sorts of marginalization, which they happen to face. They can have their own authority; time has been changed a lot. There is no need to divide people in the name of class, gender, race, ethnicity etc. The hierarchy or boundary which was constructed earlier has become useless. It works no more in the favors of a harmonious society.

III. Valorizing Subaltern Voice

Roberto Benigni reconstructs the character of the social inferiority of the race. Guido, who is like other race, undergoes the experience of the evils of so called superior race in the society. There are many ways of presenting subaltern voice. In some text subaltern voice can be heard in subaltern's native language or from their own cultural activities or in any other way. But in this movie writer/author/director has presented subaltern's voice in comic presentation in the movie changing their fate and raising their voice to subvert the evils of the society so called superior and inferior in terms of race, gender and so on.

The holocaust was an incident where millions of people were killed in an inhuman manner. It is said that among the victim of the holocaust, more than six millions were the Jews. They were made the special target of the holocaust because of Adolf Hitler programmed of Aryanization. He considered Aryan as the superior race and wanted to make the Jews inferior who were holding all the aspects of the nation that time. This very notion of Hitler aroused hatred towards the Jews and the massacre occurred, which can be regarded as the dark incident in the history.

Benigni, being based on this dark historical event has produced the movie *Life is Beautiful* in which he himself has worn the three caps of the director, co-writer and actor. This movie has presented the incident of marginalization in a humorous way that has trivialized the gravity. The movie is about one hour and fifty-four minutes (1:54 min.) long and Benigni has allocated the first half for funny and humorous incidents only. The viewers who go to the hall with an expectation of watching the holocaust movie get confused whether s/he has entered the wrong theatre. The second half has tried to present the scenes in a gloomy way representing the concentration camps and the prisoners but all the activities in the camp seems fake and hollow. The surroundings of the concentration camps and the activities are not so horrendous and

don't give the impression that prisoners (marginalized) are really suffering. This movie though based on the subalternity but presented in humorous way which hides the direct presentation of the evils of the Nazis soldiers and the suffering of margin (Jews).

This analysis has focused on the examination of the subaltern silence and Benigni's attempt to recover the silenced histories of the Jews minorities of Italy in the movie. The theory of race is elitist discourse of the Nazi. The Nazi elitism has dominated the representation of the marginalized. Italian Jews subaltern historiography is thus the only appropriate methodology to see how the subaltern voice is dominated and silenced by the racial elitist discourse of Nazi. Benigni has criticized it and set the subaltern culture and their way of life as opposition to the neo-colonial discourses in the movie. He has presented the bitter criticism against the aggressive Nazi superiority and highlights the humane and soothing qualities of the minority way of system based on love in the movie.

The research brings in theoretical insights from the scholars like Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak David Luddan, Guha, and Gramsci for the analysis of the chosen movie. These insights help us see how Jews are subjugated in the so called superior race in the society that associates the race with the roles to be performed in the society: the economically weak, and who are not present in the national authoritative position are docile objects of this conservative society. Their representation as a scapegoat, and incapability to cope up with the problem of racial discrimination their compulsion to be dominated from the economically powerful and government for a long time, their dehumanization by the so called superior race and even by the government separation of the family member, thrown in the concentration camp and compelled to work hard without good food and shelter only due to being other cast. The subaltern race is the cast that is relatively marginalized here the Jew race is

represented by Guido in particular and all the Jews in general.

Guido undergoes a series of domination subjugation and marginalization. He is judged as the inferior, lower, meek, docile, fragile and as immature cast, which is the fashion of the so called superior race in the society that associates the cast with the roles in the society. The domination upon the minority race begins from the very beginning to the end. Guido's uncle is knocked down without any fault, and it is expand (escalates) with the dehumanization in the concentration camp, when they becomes the scapegoat of the game of revenge between the Nazi ruler Adolf Hitler and culminates to the apex when Guido is used and abused by Nazi government.

Hence the movie *Life is Beautiful* by Benigni presents Guido as the prototype of marginalized race at the hand of so called superior race in the society. On the one hand he is objectified as the means for service for elite, while on the other hand he is objectified as socially inferior cast. This is how Guido like any other cast in the world so called superior society is denied his agency through their objectification. This kind of representation of Guido shows his status as the subaltern race (cast).

The present research addresses the question related to the evocation of the sense of struggle of subaltern people for their survival. Survival becomes major problem for the subaltern. And why the author employs the dominant marginal attitude in the story is the question. The research aims to solve as it is not being concerned by others.

Benigni makes fun of so called superior and intellectual but even unknown about the comic activities of character to rectify its fault. This research will be remarkable repertoire for the future researchers as it explores the subaltern struggle and silence in particular historical circumstances. It also helps to understand the marginalization of the minorities due to the power exercised by the dominant elites with the construction of the elitist discourses. Those discourses silence the minority discourses and voices

Works cited

- Benigni, Roberto and Vincenzo Cerami. *Life is Beautiful*, Milano: Einaudi, 1998.
- Beverley, John. "Subalternity, Representation, and Politics." *Postcolonial Studies*. 1.3 (1998):305-319.
- Bhadra, Gautam *The Mentality of Subalternity*: Kantanama of Rajdharma. Select Subaltern Studies. Ed Ranjit Guha. Delhi: Oxford UP, 1998. 63-69.
- Chakrobarty, Dipesh. *Invitation to a Dialogue* Subaltern Studies IV. Ed. Ranjit Guha. Delhi: Oxford UP, 1986: 360-76.
- Chatterjee, Partha. *Caste and Subaltern Consciousness*. Subaltern Studies VI. Ed. Ranjit Guha. Delhi: Oxford UP, 1989. 169-209.
- Foucault, Michael. "Power/knowledge." Hemel Hempstead: Harvester Press, 1980.
- Ghiat, Ruth Ben. The Secret Histories of Roberto Benigni's *Life is Beautiful*: The Yale Journal of Criticism, volume 14, number 1(2001): 253-266 by Yale University and the John Hopkins University Press, 2004.
- Gramsci, Antonio. *The Prison Notebooks*: Selections Tars. and Ed. Hoar and Smith. London: Lawrence and Wishort, 1973.
- Guha, Ranjit. "Introduction." Subaltern studies I: Writings on South Asian History and Society. Ed. Ranjit Guha. Oxford University press, New Delhi, 1982, vii. ...Elementary Aspects of Peasant Insurgency in Colonial India. Delhi: Oxford UP, 1983.
- Ludden, David. *Reading Subaltern studies*. Delhi: Permanent Black, 2003.
- Marcus, Millicent. *The Serious Humor of La vita e bella*. Film and Theatre 77 (1999):153.
- Said, Edward. *Orientalism*. New York: Pantheon Publication, 1978.
- Singh, Lata. "Subaltern Historiographic Critique of colonialist and national Discourses." *Indian Historical Review*, 112. Vol.21, No.1 (July, 1994): 99-112.

Spivak, Gyatri Chakravarty. *Can the Subaltern Speak?* Marxism and the Interpretation of culture. Ed. Nelson and Grossberg. Urbana: Illinois Press, 1988.

Tal, Kali. *Worlds of Hurt: 'Reading the Literatures of Trauma.'* Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1996.